

United States Patent and Trademark Office



UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF COMMERCE United States Patent and Trademark Office Address: COMMISSIONER OF PATENTS AND TRADEMARKS Washington, D.C. 20231 www.uspto.gov

APPLICATION NO.	FILING DATE	FIRST NAMED INVENTOR	ATTORNEY DOCKET NO.	CONFIRMATION NO.
09/755,644	01/06/2001	Alfred D. Roeske		4900
23535	7590 08/16/2002			
	CARROLL, LLP		EXAM	INER
101 HOWARI SUITE 350	DSTREET		TOOMER,	CEPHIA D
SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94105				
			ART UNIT	PAPER NUMBER
			1714	9
			DATE MAILED: 08/16/2002	

Please find below and/or attached an Office communication concerning this application or proceeding.

PTO-90C (Rev. 07-01)

•	Application No.	Applicant(s)
Offic Action Summary	Examiner	Group Art Unit
-The MAILING DATE of this communication appe	ears on the cover shee	t beneath the correspondence address—
P riod for Reply	_	
A SHORTENED STATUTORY PERIOD FOR REPLY IS SE OF THIS COMMUNICATION.	T TO EXPIRE	MONTH(S) FROM THE MAILING DATE
 Extensions of time may be available under the provisions of 37 (from the mailing date of this communication. If the period for reply specified above is less than thirty (30) days If NO period for reply is specified above, such period shall, by defending to reply within the set or extended period for reply will, by Any reply received by the Office later than three months after the term adjustment. See 37 CFR 1.704(b). 	s, a reply within the statutory efault, expire SIX (6) MONTH or statute, cause the applicati	minimum of thirty (30) days will be considered timely. S from the mailing date of this communication. on to become ABANDONED (35 U.S.C. & 133)
Status	d. 2	
Responsive to communication(s) filed on	8/02	
This action is FINAL.	,	
☐ Since this application is in condition for allowance excaccordance with the practice under <i>Ex parte Quayle</i> , 1	ept for formal matters, p 1935 C.D. 1 1; 453 O.G. 2	prosecution as to the merits is closed in 213.
Disposition of Claims		
© Claim(s) 1 26		is/are pending in the application
		is are perioring in the application.
Of the above claim(s)		
Of the above claim(s)		is/are withdrawn from consideration.
Of the above claim(s)		is/are withdrawn from consideration.
Of the above claim(s)		is/are withdrawn from consideration. is/are allowed. is/are rejected.
Of the above claim(s) Claim(s) Claim(s) Claim(s)		is/are withdrawn from consideration. is/are allowed. is/are rejected. is/are objected to.
Of the above claim(s) Claim(s) Claim(s) Claim(s) Claim(s) pplication Papers		is/are withdrawn from consideration. is/are allowed. is/are rejected. is/are objected to. are subject to restriction or election requirement
Of the above claim(s) Claim(s) Claim(s) Claim(s) Claim(s) Polication Papers The proposed drawing correction, filed on	is □ approve	is/are withdrawn from consideration. is/are allowed. is/are rejected. is/are objected to. are subject to restriction or election requirement d
Of the above claim(s) Claim(s) Claim(s) Claim(s) Claim(s) Description Papers The proposed drawing correction, filed on is/are ob	is □ approve	is/are withdrawn from consideration. is/are allowed. is/are rejected. is/are objected to. are subject to restriction or election requirement d
Of the above claim(s) Claim(s) Claim(s) Claim(s) Claim(s) Pplication Papers The proposed drawing correction, filed on is/are ob The specification is objected to by the Examiner.	is □ approve	is/are withdrawn from consideration. is/are allowed. is/are rejected. is/are objected to. are subject to restriction or election requirement d
Of the above claim(s) Claim(s) Claim(s) Claim(s) Claim(s) Dlaim(s) The proposed drawing correction, filed on is/are ob	is □ approve	is/are withdrawn from consideration. is/are allowed. is/are rejected. is/are objected to. are subject to restriction or election requirement d
Of the above claim(s) Claim(s) Claim(s) Claim(s) Claim(s) Claim(s) Papers The proposed drawing correction, filed on is/are ob The specification is objected to by the Examiner. The oath or declaration is objected to by the Examiner.	is □ approve	is/are withdrawn from consideration. is/are allowed. is/are rejected. is/are objected to. are subject to restriction or election requirement d
Of the above claim(s) Claim(s) Claim(s) Claim(s) Claim(s) Claim(s) Pplication Papers The proposed drawing correction, filed on is/are ob The specification is objected to by the Examiner. The oath or declaration is objected to by the Examiner.	is □ approve ojected to by the Examin	is/are withdrawn from consideration. is/are allowed. is/are rejected. is/are objected to. are subject to restriction or election requirement d
Of the above claim(s) Claim(s) Claim(s) Claim(s) Claim(s) Claim(s) pplication Papers The proposed drawing correction, filed on	is □ approve ojected to by the Examin	is/are withdrawn from consideration. is/are allowed. is/are rejected. is/are objected to. are subject to restriction or election requirement d
Of the above claim(s) Claim(s) Claim(s) Claim(s) Claim(s) Claim(s) Pplication Papers The proposed drawing correction, filed on is/are ob The drawing(s) filed on The specification is objected to by the Examiner. The oath or declaration is objected to by the Examiner riority under 35 U.S.C. § 119 (a)–(d) Acknowledgement is made of a claim for foreign priority	is □ approve ojected to by the Examin : ty under 35 U.S.C. § 119	is/are withdrawn from consideration. is/are allowed. is/are rejected. is/are objected to. are subject to restriction or election requirement d
Of the above claim(s) Claim(s) Claim(s) Claim(s) Claim(s) pplication Papers The proposed drawing correction, filed on The drawing(s) filed on The specification is objected to by the Examiner. The oath or declaration is objected to by the Examiner. The oath or declaration is objected to by the Examiner. All Some* None of the: Certified copies of the priority documents have been	is approve ojected to by the Examin ty under 35 U.S.C. § 119 en received. en received in Application	is/are withdrawn from consideration. is/are allowed. is/are rejected. is/are objected to. are subject to restriction or election requirement d
Of the above claim(s) Claim(s) Claim(s) Claim(s) Claim(s) Claim(s) pplication Papers The proposed drawing correction, filed on is/are ob The drawing(s) filed on The specification is objected to by the Examiner. The oath or declaration is objected to by the Examiner riority under 35 U.S.C. § 119 (a)–(d) Acknowledgement is made of a claim for foreign priority and acknowledgement is made of the: Certified copies of the priority documents have been copies of the certified copies of the priority documents have been copies of the certified copies of the priority documents have been copies of the certified copies of the priority documents have been copies of the certified copies of the priority documents have been copies of the certified copies of the priority documents have been copies of the certified copies of the priority documents have been copies of the certified copies of the priority documents have been copies of the certified copies of the priority documents have been copies of the certified copies of the priority documents have been copies of the certified copies of the priority documents have been copies of the certified copies of the priority documents have been copies of the certified copies of the priority documents have been copies copies of the certified copies of the priority documents have been copies	is □ approve enjected to by the Examin ty under 35 U.S.C. § 119 en received. en received in Application ents have been received	is/are withdrawn from consideration. is/are allowed. is/are rejected. is/are objected to. are subject to restriction or election requirement d
Of the above claim(s) Claim(s) Claim(s) Claim(s) Claim(s) Pplication Papers The proposed drawing correction, filed on The drawing(s) filed on The specification is objected to by the Examiner. The oath or declaration is objected to by the Examiner. The oath or declaration is objected to by the Examiner. All Some* None of the: Certified copies of the priority documents have been copies of the certified copies of the priority documents have been copies of the certified copies of the priority documents have been copies of the certified copies of the priority documents have been copies of the certified copies of the priority documents have been copies of the certified copies of the priority documents have been copies of the certified copies of the priority documents have been copies of the certified copies of the priority documents have been compared to the certified copies of the priority documents have been copies of the certified copies of the priority documents have been copies of the certified copies of the priority documents have been copies of the certified copies of the priority documents have been copies of the certified copies of the priority documents have been copies of the certified copies of the priority documents have been copies of the certified copies of the priority documents have been copies of the certified copies of the priority documents have been copies of the certified copies of the priority documents have been copies of the certified copies of the priority documents have been copies of the certified copies c	is approve pjected to by the Examinate to a purpose the examinate of the examinate of the examinate of the examinate of the example of the e	is/are withdrawn from consideration. is/are allowed. is/are rejected. is/are objected to. are subject to restriction or election requirement d d disapproved. er (a)-(d).
Of the above claim(s) Claim(s) Claim(s) Claim(s) Claim(s) Claim(s) Pplication Papers The proposed drawing correction, filed on is/are ob The drawing(s) filed on The specification is objected to by the Examiner. The oath or declaration is objected to by the Examiner riority under 35 U.S.C. § 119 (a)–(d) Acknowledgement is made of a claim for foreign priority and acknowledgement is made of the: Certified copies of the priority documents have been Certified copies of the certified copies of the priority documents have been Copies of the certified copies of the priority documents	is approve pjected to by the Examinate to a purpose the examinate of the examinate of the examinate of the examinate of the example of the e	is/are withdrawn from consideration. is/are allowed. is/are rejected. is/are objected to. are subject to restriction or election requirement d d disapproved. er (a)-(d).
Of the above claim(s) Claim(s) Claim(s) Claim(s) Claim(s) pplication Papers The proposed drawing correction, filed on is/are ob The drawing(s) filed on The specification is objected to by the Examiner. The oath or declaration is objected to by the Examiner riority under 35 U.S.C. § 119 (a)–(d) Acknowledgement is made of a claim for foreign priori All Some* None of the: Certified copies of the priority documents have been Copies of the certified copies of the priority documents have been copies of the certified copies of the priority documents have been compared to the certified copies of the priority documents have been copies of the certified copies of the priority documents have been copies of the certified copies of the priority documents have been copies of the certified copies of the priority documents have been copies of the certified copies of the priority documents have been copies of the certified copies of the priority documents have been copies of the certified copies of the priority documents have been copies of the certified copies of the priority documents have been copies of the certified copies of the priority documents have been copies of the certified copies of the priority documents have been copies of the certified copies of the priority documents have been copies of the certified copies of the priority documents have been copies of the certified copies of the priority documents have been copies of the certified copies of the priority documents have been copies of the certified copies of the priority documents have been copies of the certified copies of the priority documents have been copies of the certified copies of the ce	is approve ojected to by the Examinate under 35 U.S.C. § 119 en received. en received in Application ents have been received onal Bureau (PCT Rule 1	is/are withdrawn from consideration. is/are allowed. is/are rejected. is/are objected to. are subject to restriction or election requirement d d disapproved. er (a)-(d).
Of the above claim(s) Claim(s) Claim(s) Claim(s) Claim(s) Papers The proposed drawing correction, filed on The drawing(s) filed on The specification is objected to by the Examiner. The oath or declaration is objected to by the Examiner. The oath or declaration is objected to by the Examiner. Acknowledgement is made of a claim for foreign priori All Some* None of the: Certified copies of the priority documents have been Copies of the certified copies of the priority documents have been compared to the priority documents have been compared to the priority documents have been compared to the certified copies of the priority documents have been copies of the certified copies of the priority documents have been copies of the certified copies of the priority documents have been copies of the certified copies of the priority documents have been copies of the certified copies of the priority documents have been copies of the certified copies of the priority documents have been copies of the certified copies of the priority documents have been copies of the certified copies of the priority documents have been copies of the certified copies of the priority documents have been copies of the certified copies of the priority documents have been copies of the certified copies of the priority documents have been copies of the certified copies of the priority documents have been copies of the certified copies of the priority documents have been copies of the certified copies of the priority documents have been copies of the priority documents have b	is approve ojected to by the Examinate under 35 U.S.C. § 119 en received. en received in Application ents have been received onal Bureau (PCT Rule 1	is/are withdrawn from consideration. is/are allowed. is/are rejected. is/are objected to. are subject to restriction or election requirement d d disapproved. er (a)-(d).
Of the above claim(s) The proposed drawing correction, filed on	is approve pjected to by the Examination and application received. In received in Application ents have been received and Bureau (PCT Rule 1)	is/are withdrawn from consideration. is/are allowed. is/are rejected. is/are objected to. are subject to restriction or election requirement d
Of the above claim(s) Interpose of the priopication, filed on	is approve ojected to by the Examinate of the Examinate o	is/are withdrawn from consideration. is/are allowed. is/are rejected. is/are objected to. are subject to restriction or election requirement d disapproved. er (a)-(d).

Application/Control Number: 09/755,644

Art Unit: 1714

DETAILED ACTION

This Office action is in response to the amendment filed May 08, 2002 in which claims 1, 4, 5, 9, 10, 13, 16, 18, 19, 24, 25 and 26 were amended.

The objection to the specification is withdrawn in view of the amendment o the claims.

The rejection of the claims under USC 112, second paragraph is withdrawn in view of the amendment to the claims and applicant's comments.

The 103 rejections of the claims over McLaren and Will are withdrawn in view of Applicants arguments.

Claims 1-26 are rejected under 35 USC 103 (a) as being unpatentable over Tao for the reasons of record.

Applicant argues that Tao is more concerned with producing a candle that is solid at room temperature then he is with whether the triglyceride is hydrogenated. Applicant argues that Tao teaches away from the present invention because he teaches that the "free fatty acids and fatty acid components of the triglycerides may be unsaturated."

Tao clearly teaches that the triglycerides of his invention may be <u>fully hydrogenated</u>. A fully hydrogenated triglyceride has an lodine Value of zero. This clearly meets the limitations of the claims regarding the hydrogenated triglycerides.

Regarding the formation of soot, it would be reasonable to expect that the candle composition of Tao meets this limitation since Tao teaches a composition wherein the amounts of triglyceride and paraffin may be varied to obtain the type of candle desired by patentee.

Application/Control Number: 09/755,644

Art Unit: 1714

The examiner recognizes that Tao teaches that the unsaturated fatty material may be used in his invention; however, in no way is Tao limited to such compounds. This is especially true since Tao teaches that he prefers that the chains of the triglycerides are saturated.

THIS ACTION IS MADE FINAL. Applicant is reminded of the extension of time policy as set forth in 37 CFR 1.136(a).

A shortened statutory period for reply to this final action is set to expire THREE MONTHS from the mailing date of this action. In the event a first reply is filed within TWO MONTHS of the mailing date of this final action and the advisory action is not mailed until after the end of the THREE-MONTH shortened statutory period, then the shortened statutory period will expire on the date the advisory action is mailed, and any extension fee pursuant to 37 CFR 1.136(a) will be calculated from the mailing date of the advisory action. In no event, however, will the statutory period for reply expire later than SIX MONTHS from the mailing date of this final action.

Any inquiry concerning this communication or earlier communications from the examiner should be directed to Cephia D. Toomer whose telephone number is 703-308-2509. The examiner can normally be reached on Monday-Friday.

If attempts to reach the examiner by telephone are unsuccessful, the examiner's supervisor, Vasu Jagannathan can be reached on 703-306-2777. The fax phone numbers for the organization where this application or proceeding is assigned are 703-872-9310 for regular communications and 703-872-9310 for After Final communications.



Application/Control Number: 09/755,644

Art Unit: 1714

Any inquiry of a general nature or relating to the status of this application or proceeding should be directed to the receptionist whose telephone number is 703-308-0661.

Cephia D. Toomer Primary Examiner Art Unit 1714

09755644\9 August 16, 2002